

MINUTES
MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS
PLANNING & EXTERNAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE
METROPOLITAN ATLANTA RAPID TRANSIT AUTHORITY
November 28, 2018

The Board of Directors Planning & External Relations Committee met on November 28, 2018 at 9:42 a.m. in the Board Room on the 6th Floor of the MARTA Headquarters Building, 2424 Piedmont Road, Atlanta, Georgia.

Board Members Present

Roberta Abdul-Salaam
Frederick L. Daniels, Jr.
Jim Durrett
Roderick E. Edmond
William 'Bill' Floyd
Jerry Griffin, Chair
Freda B. Hardage
Alicia M. Ivey
John "Al" Pond
Christopher S. Tomlinson*
W. Thomas Worthy

MARTA officials in attendance were: General Manager/ CEO Jeffrey A. Parker; C-Suite Team Members Chief of System Safety, Security & Emergency Management/Police Wanda Dunham, Chief Financial Officer Gordon L. Hutchinson, Chief of Staff Melissa Mullinax and Chief Counsel Elizabeth O'Neill; AGMs LaShanda Dawkins, Virgil Fludd, James Sibert (Acting), David Springstead, Kirk Talbott, Emil Tzanov and Thomas Young (Interim); Senior Directors Ed Bishop (Acting), Jennifer Jinadu-Wright and Colleen Kiernan; Directors James Biscoe, Lisa DeGrace, Robert Goodwin, Jonathan Hunt, Donna Jennings, Remy Saintil and Donald Williams; Managers Stephany Fisher and Tony Griffin; Department Administrators Kenya Hammond and Debra Oliver. Others in attendance Hunter Abel, Carlos Arrietta, Adrien Carter, Amar Gannarapu, Kareem Jackson, Roderick Lyles, Reginald Masters, Courtne Middlebrooks, Dedric Parham, LaTonya Pope, Tracie Roberson, Derrick Terry and Ryan VanSickle

Also in attendance Ryan Ellis, Jennifer Hibbert and Jaquitta Williams of AECOM; Jennifer Laposa of SRTA; Frank Picarelli of Segal Group and Jim Schmidt of HNTB.

***Christopher Tomlinson is Executive Director of Georgia Regional Transportation Authority (GRTA) and is therefore a non-voting member of the MARTA Board of Directors.**

Approval of the October 4, 2018 Planning & External Relations Committee Meeting Minutes

On motion by Mr. Floyd seconded by Mr. Pond, the minutes were unanimously approved by a vote of 4 to 0, with 5* members present.

Resolution Authorizing the Solicitation of Proposals for the Procurement of Transit and Digital Advertising, RFP P42916

Mr. T. Griffin presented a resolution seeking approval to issue a RFP for Transit and Digital Advertising for a (five) 5 year period from January 2020 to December 2024.

Transit Advertising is the advertising in and on MARTA Revenue vehicles as well as in MARTA's stations.

Digital Sign Advertising is advertising on MARTA's electronic information signs in MARTA's rail stations.

The minimum guaranteed revenue for the current Transit contract is \$17.12M and 1.5M for Digital revenue.

Over the last 10-15 years the top twelve (12) transit agencies have been dominated by two (2) advertising contractors:

- 1.) Outfront Media
- 2.) Intersection

Currently MARTA's contractor is serviced by Outfront Media.

Outfront Media and Intersection have changed their names over the years, but maintained control within the major transit agencies.

MARTA expects Outfront Media and Intersection to continue their domination by being the primary bidders for this Request for Proposal.

MARTA has two (2) separate contracts for Transit and Digital sign advertising with both contracts expiring December 31, 2019.

MARTA will issue both mediums in the same RFP, with the options to be separately awarded, giving MARTA the flexibility to award the contract to two (2) different contractors or to the same contractor if it is beneficial.

Current Transit agreement gives MARTA immediate opportunity to exercise two (2) one (1) year options in 2020 and in 2021. However, the agreement stipulates the contractors must be notified of MARTA's intent to do so no later than June 30, 2019.

In order to compare MARTA's RFP submission against the options currently on the table, an RFP with the intent of receiving proposals must be received by the end of the first quarter in 2019.

Dr. Edmond confirmed the contract expires at the end of 2019. He asked what is it in the terms of the current contract that makes it necessary to rebid.

Mr. T. Griffin said MARTA has considered re-bidding over the last several months because the market is slightly elevated. MARTA decided to extinguish a RFP and if a proposal returns higher than what the options are then it would put MARTA in a better position to take the higher option.

Mr. Floyd asked does MARTA have restrictions regarding advertisement on buses.

Mr. T. Griffin said yes, MARTA has a policy which restricts tobacco and sexual content issues.

Mr. Floyd asked who is responsible for displaying advertisement on MARTA's buses.

Mr. T. Griffin said the contractor is responsible for displaying on MARTA's buses.

Mr. Floyd said considering that twelve (12) agencies utilize advertising contractors, what would be the cost for MARTA to do in-house advertising.

Mr. T. Griffin said MARTA does not have the manpower for advertising and contractors have the credentials and contacts to be more efficient.

Mr. Tomlinson asked if additional contractors will respond to the RFP.

Mr. T. Griffin said in the past there has been a third contractor but usually the cost is prohibitive.

Mr. Tomlinson asked if MARTA participates in a revenue share above the guaranteed revenue.

Mr. T. Griffin said yes; With the Transit Contract in place, MARTA will receive the minimum guarantee regarding potential economy or sales issues.

Mr. Tomlinson asked if contractors are bidding the minimum amount plus the percentage revenue.

Mr. T. Griffin said MARTA requires the advertising contractor provide a minimum guarantee and a commission percentage.

Dr. Edmond said three (3) years ago the Board had a robust discussion regarding MARTA's advertising policy and added that tasteful alcohol beverages like Courvoisier and Cognac could be advertised.

Mr. T. Griffin said yes; if alcohol is advertised, it must include a drink responsible message, be universal and not target one specific area.

Mr. Floyd asked if Digital advertising is displayed on MARTA's or the contractor's signs.

Mr. T. Griffin said the contract will be effective in 2020 and MARTA will be using in-house AVIS signs.

On motion by Mrs. Hardage seconded by Mr. Pond, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 5 to 0, with 6* members present.

Resolution Authorizing the Solicitation of Proposals for Bus Stop Amenities Program

Mr. VanSickle presented a resolution requesting authorization for the solicitation of proposals for the Bus Stop Amenities Program, which will install up to 1,000 bus shelters and bench amenities over a five (5) year period.

Progress to Date

- Prior to 2018, 10 or less shelters were typically installed per year
- Since February 2018
 - 35 new shelters were installed
 - 7 new benches were installed

- 20 more new shelters are in progress
- Over 300 potential shelter sites were evaluated
- Additional initiative now underway

RFP Details

- 5- year contract
- MARTA determines sites with input from local government
- Vendor surveys, designs, obtains amenities, permits, and installs
- Options for expansion if service area grows
- Streamline turnkey approach minimized MARTA resources, maximizes flexibility
- Comprehensive amenity options to adapt to a wide array of sites

Potential Shelter and Bench Options

- Standard MARTA non-advertising shelters
- Different benches and seating products

Next Steps

- Board authorization
- Proposal solicitation
- Proposal evaluation
- Select vendor
- Sign contract
- Not to proceed
- We will come back to update the Board about the overall initiative on a regular basis

Mr. Pond said a contract was discussed approximately a year ago and asked if MARTA is referring to the same contract from the previous year.

Mr. Parker said yes, MARTA is referring to the same contract from the previous year.

Planning & External Relations Committee

11/28/18

Page 6

Mr. Pond said transit Authorities have their own standards for bus stops and asked how would the process work.

Mr. Parker said MARTA will work with cities and counties based upon jurisdictions and coordinate appropriately.

Mr. Pond asked if it is in MARTA's budget to go from installing a few bus shelters within a year to 1,000 bus shelters over the five (5) year requested period.

Mr. Parker said MARTA has the funds in the current Capital Budget to install 1,000 bus shelters and will submit a request to increase funding in the Capital Program.

Mrs. Hardage said cities in North Fulton have been working on bus stop plans and hired Kimberly Horn to conduct research assisting them with a three (3) year plan in the city of Alpharetta.

Mr. Parker said some communities in North Fulton have specific design of bus shelter preferences and MARTA will work with these communities to deliver and tailor to their needs.

Mrs. Hardage said contractors are encouraged to install bus shelters where sidewalks are removed.

Mr. Parker said MARTA has a tremendous deficit installing bus shelters and has a responsibility of installing sidewalks where patrons with mobility needs can access MARTA's buses.

Mr. Tomlinson asked if the contractor is responsible for installing bus signage.

Mr. VanSickle said the contractor would install the bus shelter and MARTA's Sign Shop will install the signage.

Mr. Daniels asked if MARTA can consider signage that can be consistent, easily modified and cost efficient.

Mr. VanSickle said the Regional Bus Stop design has minimum branding that is relatively easy to change.

Mr. J. Griffin asked if adding 1,000 bus shelters over the five (5) year period will change MARTA's ad revenue.

Mr. VanSickle said the bus shelters proposed in the program are non-advertising amenities and will not affect MARTA's advertising stock.

Mr. J. Griffin asked if a projected time frame can be provided.

Mr. VanSickle said MARTA is expecting the RFP process to take six (6) to nine (9) months after soliciting proposals are processed.

Mrs. Hardage asked why does the RFP process take six (6) to nine (9) months.

Mr. VanSickle said MARTA will be working through the Procurement process.

Mr. Parker said MARTA will ensure that the RFP process will not take six (6) to nine (9) months and will provide a schedule with potential commitment dates.

Mr. J. Griffin asked if the current process for installing bus shelters will continue.

Mr. VanSickle said yes. MARTA has twenty (20) additional projects lined up to ensure that continuous installations are processed before the RFP is completed.

On motion by Mrs. Pond seconded by Mr. Durrett, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 8 to 0, with 9* members present.

Resolution Authorizing the Award of a Contract for the Procurement of Clayton County Advertising Benches, RFP P39636

Mr. T. Griffin requested approval of a resolution authorizing the General Manager/CEO or his delegate to enter into a contract for the procurement of Clayton County Advertising Benches, RFP 39636, with Creative Outdoor Advertising of America Ltd.

Planning & External Relations Committee

11/28/18

Page 8

In accordance with Section 14 (k) of the MARTA Act, staff negotiated with two (2) potential proponents to obtain proposals. In the negotiation process, Creative Outdoor Advertising of America Ltd. submitted the most advantageous proposal in the amount of \$300K. Staff has determined that the offer submitted by Creative Outdoor Advertising of America Ltd. is in the best interest of the Authority to accept and Creative Outdoor Advertising of America Ltd. is capable of performing the Contract.

Staff Recommendation Award Contract to Creative Outdoor Advertising:

- The largest street furniture (bench) advertising firm in North America
- Established in 1984
- Over 125 full and part time employees
- 250+ municipal and transit contracts across North America
- 10,000 units in place
- 4,800 sponsoring advertisers

Creative Outdoor Advertising (COA) Maintenance:

Maintenance service - one service visit per week:

- Cleaning all Benches regularly
- Keeping immediate area clean and tidy
- Removing Graffiti
- Repairing Vandalism
- Keeping all Advertising current

Additional Features:

- Provide Waste Receptacles (County will empty)
- Toll Free Service Hotline – 24Hr Response time, 4Hr Emergency Response Time
- Each Bench is tagged with GPS-verified Barcode
- Vendor will install 1 non-ad bench for every 15 ad benches installed (20 Non-Ad benches)

Mr. Pond asked how is it possible for two (2) contractors to have identical proposals in the amount of \$300K for a ten (10) year contract.

Mr. T. Griffin said majority contractors have similar standard prices with a minimum guarantee of \$100.00 per bench per year.

Mr. Tomlinson asked how does Creative Outdoor Advertising of America, Ltd. proposal compare to MARTA's exiting contract in other jurisdictions.

Mr. T. Griffin said no other contractors are installing advertising benches in additional jurisdictions.

Mr. Daniels said the presentation indicated that trash receptacles will be monitored on a weekly basis and asked how can MARTA ensure that receptacles don't overflow especially at frequently used stops.

Mr. T. Griffin said MARTA have bus stop inspectors that will work to notify Creative Outdoor regarding trash accumulations and the need to focus their activity and visits at high ridership stops. The contractor will also provide a hotline for individuals report any bus stop issues that will be addressed within four (4) to twenty-four (24) hours.

Mr. J. Griffin asked if the receptacle contract was different from Creative Outdoor contract.

Mr. T. Griffin said yes, the contracts are different.

Ms. Abdul-Salaam said in conjunction with trash receptacle monitoring, Clayton County's COO is re-instituting Keep Clayton Beautiful Campaign which would be an additional measure to alleviate trash receptacle overflow.

On motion by Mr. Durrett seconded by Mr. Daniels, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 9 to 0, with 10* members present.

Resolution to Adopt December 2018 Service Modifications

Mr. Williams presented this resolution requesting adoption of December 2018 service modifications.

The MARTA Board proposed modifications for the following routes:

- Route 89 – Old National Highway, Clayton/Fulton
- Route 143 – Windward Park & Ride, Fulton

The MARTA Act and the MARTA Service Standards require public input and consideration before bus and rail modifications are approved by the Board for implementation.

The route modifications were developed based on input and feedback from passengers, operators and communities as well as MARTA's ongoing service monitoring and evaluation to identify and pursue opportunities to enhance service.

The Public Hearings Were Conducted:

- Monday, September 17, 2018 (Fulton County)
- Tuesday, September 18, 2018 (Clayton County)

Mr. J. Griffin said that if one has an issue with an item being proposed attending Public Hearings can change the outcome of the proposed modification.

On motion by Mrs. Hardage seconded by Mr. Durrett, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 9 to 0, with 10* members present.

Briefing – Clayton Locally Preferred Alternative Update

Mrs. Roberson provided an update on planning activities, major milestones, evaluation and criteria and technical analysis outcomes to confirm the recommendation of the highest-ranking corridors in the Clayton high capacity transit study, Norfolk Southern corridor and SR 85/ SR 139 (MARTA bus route 196 and 191), as the Locally Preferred Alternative(s) (LPA)

Clayton Program Commitments

- | | |
|------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| - Local Bus Service | - Passenger Bus Amenities |
| - High Capacity Transit Initiative | - Citizens Advisory Group |
| - County-Wide Transit Plan | - Operations and Maintenance Facility |
| - Park and Ride lots | - Breeze Machines |
| - Job Fairs | |

High Capacity Transit Progress

- Determined Purpose and Need
- Examined potential for high capacity transit
- Evaluated different technologies
- Identified and evaluated seven high priority corridors
- Ongoing public outreach
 - Citizen's Advisory Group (CAG)
 - Stakeholder Advisory Committee
 - Technical Advisory Committee

Seven (7) Priority Corridors were refined to top three (3):

- SR 85
- US 41 Tara Blvd
- Norfolk Southern Line

Corridor Evaluation Framework

- Public Outreach
- Surveying
- Technical Data

Recommended LPA

- Commuter Rail (Norfolk Southern)
- Bus Rapid Transit – SR 85/SR 139 (MARTA Bus Routes 196 and 191)

Norfolk Southern Corridor

Description

- 22-mile corridor
- Commuter rail
- East Point MARTA Station to Lovejoy
- In Norfolk Southern right-of-way

Benefits

- Connects important nodes
(Southlake Mall, Mount Zion, Fort Gillen, Clayton State University)
- Improves access to jobs and education
- Corridor with highest commercial development
- Forecasted growth by 2040
(20% population, 11% employment)

SR 85 / SR 139 (MARTA Bus Routes 196 and 191)

Description

- Bus Rapid Transit
- Improved transit amenities, such as shelters
- Express service with limited stops
- Connects College Park, Riverdale and Morrow along SR 85, Upper Riverdale Rd, SR 138

Benefits

- Connects important nodes
(Southlake Mall, Southern Regional Medical Center, College Park Station)
- Utilizes Clayton County high performing routes
- Lower cost project and faster project implementation
- Improves access to jobs and education

What is the Pathway Forward?

- Approval of Locally Preferred Alternatives
(November 2018, PER Approval)
(December 2018, Board Approval)
- Continue community outreach
- Conduct environmental analysis
(Environmental Document)

(Coordinate with federal and state agencies)

- Coordinate with Norfolk Southern
- Develop Bus Rapid Transit Implementation Strategy
- Complete County-wide Transit Plan
- Continue to explore East/West connections

Ms. Abdul-Salaam thanked the Planning Department for their hard work in Clayton County and asked for an update for bus service from Highway 138 to Old National.

Mr. Williams said bus service from 138 to Old National is still in the planning process and will be discussed in future meetings.

Mr. Daniels asked what is the vision for the BRT portion.

Mrs. Hibbert said the vision will be more a phased project which will resemble interior BRT with enhancements like Q Jump Lanes or Transit Signal Priority. Then, as the project advances MARTA can phase in dedicated lanes for BRT saving passengers more travel time.

Mr. Daniels said with Atlanta's congested traffic, BRT would likely be unsuccessful and dedicates his support with dedicated lanes.

Mr. Williams said MARTA will collaborate with local jurisdictions and GDOT to discuss dedicated lanes on GA-400 and I-20 corridors.

Ms. Abdul-Salaam said MARTA recognizes that SR 139 and SR 85 belongs to the State and collaboration and corporation will be needed to request dedicated lane usage.

Mr. Tomlinson thanked the Planning Department for putting together a great plan and noted that MARTA must be mindful on when to start calling the enhanced service BRT.

Mr. Griffin said occasionally MARTA references BRT indicating transit improvement.

Mr. Tomlinson said it's important for MARTA to continue be purposeful and indicated that he would be willing to assist at State level.

Resolution to Adopt Clayton Locally Preferred Alternative

Mrs. Roberson presented this resolution recommending that the MARTA Board of Directors adopt the planning-level Locally Preferred Alternative(s) (LPA), defining the mode and general corridor alignment, as part of the Clayton County Transit Initiative.

The SR 85 / SR 139 (MARTA bus routes 196 and 191) addresses demand for transit in several multi-family residential areas with high bus ridership in the MARTA system; the corridor makes vital connection to the Clayton County Justice Center; serves local nodes (Regional Medical Center, Southlake Mall and College Park MARTA station); serves highest percentage of commute trips through the county from adjacent counties to regional employment centers, utilizes existing primary routes servicing Northwestern portion of the county and the City of Riverdale.

On motion by Mrs. Hardage seconded by Mr. Durrett, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 9 to 0, with 10* members present.

Briefing – Quality of Service Survey FY 2018 Annual Update

Mr. Goodwin provided an update on Quality of Service for FY 2018.

The Quality of Service Survey Provides the Voice of the Customer

Answers Two Key Questions

- *What aspects of service are the most important to MARTA's patrons*
- *How is MARTA performing relative to what's important to patrons*

Satisfaction Attributes

- | | |
|-------------------------|-----------------------|
| - Customer Satisfaction | - Customer Service |
| - Customer Information | - Reliability |
| - Convenience | - Safety and Security |
| - Comfort | - Cleanliness |
| - Title VI Data | |

MARTA Surveyed Over 5,000 Patrons Annually

- Includes 52 ratings covering bus, rail, stops, stations, and more
- Conducted on rail platforms and fixed route buses, 6:00AM – 9:00PM – 7 days a week

In FY 2018, 80% of patrons were “satisfied” or “very satisfied” with MARTA overall.

The satisfaction rate in FY 2018 was the second highest since FY 2000.

MARTA’s satisfaction rating is consistent with other Transit Agencies.

Over 80% of patrons cited reliability, convenience, and customer service attributes when asked why they were satisfied or dissatisfied.

Ratings by category changed little over the past year

- 4.0 stars or above indicates a job well done
- 4.0 stars or below indicates need for improvement

FY 2017 below 4.0 stars

- Reliability
- Cleanliness
- Convenience

FY2018 below 4.0 stars

- Reliability
- Cleanliness
- Convenience

Run Committees are addressing bus on-time performance:

- Chaired by garage Superintendents
- Staffed by departments that touch bus service
- Identifying problems on a route-by-route basis
- Recommending and implementing solutions

The More MARTA Program is increasing bus frequency and expanding hours of service, including nights and weekends, in the City of Atlanta.

Working to Improve Amenities

- Elevator Rehabilitation Program (June 2018)
- Station Restroom Renovation and Expansion Program

Summary

- Satisfaction rate in FY 2018 was second highest since FY 2000 and consistent with other transit agencies.
- MARTA is working to improve service attributes that impact customer satisfaction

Mr. Daniels asked how were the Transit Systems comparisons selected.

Mr. Goodwin said the Transit Systems were selected based upon accessible findings.

Mr. Daniels said that it is important for MARTA to be consistent with using Transit Systems.

Mr. Goodwin agreed.

Mr. Daniels said based upon the presentation, station restrooms will be added early spring 2019 and asked for the process and a detailed timeframe.

Mr. Parker said the hours of station restrooms have been extended from 7:00PM to 10:30PM in order to make restrooms more accessible and easier to access.

Mr. Springstead said MARTA is currently re-writing restroom policies to remain open until the end of employees' shifts and that an RFP will be presented in early spring 2019 requesting restroom renovations.

Mr. Daniels said that members of the Board are frequently asked questions regarding station restrooms. He asked for a detailed time frame with a set deadline.

Mr. Springstead said there is a multiple phase timeline that he will revise and present to the Board.

Ms. Abdul-Salaam said Mr. Krisak presented a proposal including self-cleaning restrooms to the Board approximately one year ago. She asked for an update regarding his presentation.

Mr. Springstead said with self-cleaning restrooms being expensive and problematic MARTA will install hardened materials to ensure that appliances will have longevity.

Ms. Abdul-Salaam asked was Mr. Krisak's plan alleviated.

Mr. Springstead said MARTA has decided to proceed with hardened material which is a safer option for the Authority.

Mr. Floyd asked if patrons provided the same response for 'least' and 'most' satisfied performance with MARTA.

Mr. Goodwin said the responses are categorized based upon specific details within the questions.

Mr. Abdul-Salaam asked if the Quality of Service Survey included Mobility.

Mr. Goodwin said Mobility is measured by a different Survey.

Briefing – Media Impressions

Mrs. Fisher provided an overview of the media relations activities from July to September 2018.

At Your Service

- MARTA released service information for two (2) high ridership events
 - Peachtree Road Race
 - Major League Soccer All Star Game
- Produced 26 press releases and media alerts
- Partnered with Miller Lite to offer free rides to Falcons games
- Opened fifth Fresh MARTA Market at Bankhead

Planning & External Relations Committee

11/28/18

Page 18

Keeping Score

- Communications Department monitored coverage on TV, radio, online and print
- Reached an audience of 101.7 million people
- MARTA was mentioned 8,700 times
- Media coverage had an advertising value equivalent of \$26.7M

Running the Numbers

- 29% Positive News Coverage
- 43% Neutral News Coverage
- 28% Negative News Coverage

Media Attention

- | | |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| - More MARTA Community Forums | - Midtown Station Enhancements |
| - National Voter Registration Day | - Atlanta Street Car Ownership |
| - Hero Bus Operator | - West End Station Soccer |

* * *

Adjournment

The meeting of the Planning & External Relations Committee adjourned at 11:12 a.m.